MATTERS RAISED WITH PERMISSION

Reported Statement of a Representative of People's Republic of China Regarding Arunachal Pradesh.

THE LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION (SHRI JASWANT SINGH): Mr. Chairman, Sir, personally, I did not wish to raise this issue at all. Indeed I am compelled to raise it only because yesterday we had made an appeal to the Government on a completely unacceptable statement made by a high dignitary of the People's Republic of China. We made the position of India explicit and clear that the two Houses of Parliament adopted a Joint Resolution declaring unequivocally and clearly that Arunachal is and shall remain a part and parcel of the territory of India. I do not understand, Sir, what difficulty there was or is on this account. One of the difficulties explained was that His Excellency President Hu Jintao was still in the country. So, it would be unwise to do so. Then, equally unwise was that representative to make the statement, on the soil of India and on the eve of the visit that is why I am saddened to raise this issue. There is no doubt that in your very long public life and service, informs you very well and it is almost fifty years old, that the first intrusions that had taken place in Barahoti was in1954. Since, then we have travelled a very great deal. Our difficulty arises because we continue to face ambivalence on this subject. I submit Sir, that ambivalence on issues of such high import, in fact, not just in the long-run but even in the short-run is extremely damaging and detrimental to the national interest. There was a limited request, and that limited request is what I rise to reiterate. Let the House reaffirm clearly and unequivocally, "अरुणाचल प्रदेश भारत का अविभाज्य अंग है।" I see no difficulty in this thing ...(*Interruptions*).. I understand that my friends in the Communist Party have always had some difficulties in this regard ...(*Interruptions*)...

श्री सभापति: आप बाद में बोल लीजिएगा। ...(*व्यवधान*)... Please take your seats *(Interruptions)*... Please take your seats. *(Interruptions)*... Please take your seats. *(Interruptions)*... आप बैठिए ...(*व्यवधान*)... बैठिए ...(*व्यवधान*)... ठीक है।

SHRI JASWANT SINGH: It would be so much better, so infinitely better is that ire and anger were directed at the misbehaviour of the Peoples' Republic of China, and not towards me.I recollect very well from — it is with great hesitation that I say this; I don't normally like to speak about

this at all because it is a humiliating subejct on which to speak, but it struck my sense of irony— 24th November, 1962 and 24th November, 2006, the years that have passed, and it is on night of 21st and 22nd November, 1962 that following upon the invasion by the People's Republic of China a ceasefire was unilaterally declared and Late Pandit Jawaharlal Nehru had to come and speak here. I recollect very well that in this very House I had requested Members of the Communist Party of India, easier ...*(Interruptions)*... to state unequivocally and clearly that the Peoples' Republic of China is the aggressor. ...*(Interruptions)*... Till today that has not happened. In 1962, a very sorry and sad episode had taken place in the country. Then, the Hose was called prematurely, and I recollect very well,Sir Possibly, the longest debate in the history of India, lasting over eight days, wherein 165 Members then spoke, had taken place in Parliament. There was only one issue that was discused, and that issue was 'the aggression by China'. Till today, the CPM is yet to clearly and unequivocally declare that China had committed aggression. They are sitting on Indian soil. That is my difficulty. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: You will be allowed to speak. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI JASWANT SINGH: We know that the Government is today subjected and held to ransom by the CPM. We know that the policies are determined not by the Government, but by the CPM. ...*(Interruptions)*... I appeal to the Government that, at least,important Foreign Policy isues, issues that are of vital importance to the country, that judge the territorial integrity of the country, are decided by the Government and not by the proxy Members. What is the issue after all ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY (Pondicherry): Have you heard the statement of the Foreign Secretary? (*Interruptions*)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Mr. Narayanasamy, please don't disturb. *(Interruptions)* Please take your seat. If you want to speak, I will allow you. *(Interruptions)* Nothing will go on record. (*Interruptions*) Nothing will go on record. (*Interruptions*) Please don't disturb. If you want to speak, I will allow you. But, please don't interrupt. *(Interruptions)* आप जब भी बोलना चाहेंगे, मैं परमिशन दूंगा, लेकिन बीच में हस्तक्षेप मत कीजिए। बैठ जाइए। ...(व्यवधान)... सुषमा जी, छोड़िए ...बोलने दीजिए। ...(व्यवधान)... बोलने दीजिए। ...(व्यवधान)...

श्री सभापति: आप क्यों इन्टरेप्ट कर रहे हैं? ...(व्यवधान)... ठीक है, आप बैठिए। ...(व्यवधान)... लीडर ऑफ दि अपोजिशन। ...(व्यवधान)...

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज (मध्य प्रदेश): सर, भारत की एकता और अखंडता का सवाल है और आपके मुख्य मंत्री कहते हैं ...(व्यवधान)... उन्हें पता नहीं है कि अरुणाचल कहां पर है? ...(व्यवधान)...

श्री सभापति: आप लोग बैठिए। ...(व्यवधान)... आप बैठिए। ...(व्यवधान)...

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज: अरुणाचल के मुख्य मंत्री कहते हैं, उन्हें पता नहीं है कि अरुणाचल किसका हिस्सा है। ...(व्यवधान)...

SHRI PRAVEEN RASHTRAPAL: Mr. Chairman, Sir, I would like to know ...*(Interruptions)*... or he is making an allegation during the Zero Hour. ...*(Interruptions)*...

Please take your seats. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI JASWANT SINGH: Sir, as I started by saying, ordinarily it does not make us happy to raise this subject. And it has gone on for half a century only because of this kind of ambivalent attitude. I submit, Sir, that timidity or mealy-mouthedness in the expression of total, robust commitment to India's territorial integrity is not and cannot be a good policy. That is all that I am trying to appeal to my friends. ...*(Interruptions)*... May I repeat, Sir? ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY (West Bengal): Can I now respond, Sir ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRIMATI SUSHMA SWARAJ: Let him complete. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI JASWANT SINGH: Sir, interruptions actually sadden me, and I am compelled, therefore, to quote just two statements of a debate that has taken place in our own Parliament. The first, Sir, is the question of the commitment of aggression by the Chinese on our territory. Sir, a point was then made that the Chinese have not committed aggression. That is the point.

AN HON. MEMBER: When?

SHRI JASWANT SINGH: He says so ...*(Interruptions)*... Here is a comment made. "We commit aggression on ourselves". That would become the reverse. If China has not committed aggression on us, are we committing

aggression on ourselves in Arunachal pradesh? "We commit aggression on ourselves; we commit aggression on the soil of our own country, and they cross the Thangla ridge to come and defend it." This was stated, Sir, in 1962 by the Late Prime Minister , Shri Jawaharlal Nehru, in response to the debate that had taken place.Let me say, Sir, with a great hesitation because it gives me no delight to go into that sad and sorry episode of our history.

Here is another comment, Sir. He was a very, very senior Member of the Parliament and remained in the service of Parliament for a very long time. उन्होंने अपने भाषण में कहा था कि चीन के मोटिव्स चाहे जो कुछ भी हों, यही तो सबसे बड़ा झगड़ा इन वर्षों में रहा है और हम सदा कहते रहे हैं कि चीन ने हमारे ऊपर आक्रमण किया है, जिसे साम्यवादी दल ने नहीं माना ...(**व्यवधान**)... और आज की स्थिति के बावजूद भी ...(**व्यवधान**)... He is a very distinguished and a very honourable Member of Parliament. Indeed, in his later life, I always held him in very high regard. I referred to Shri Hiren Mukherjee. ...*(Interruptions)*... उन्होंने कहा है कि इसके होने के बाद भी श्री मुखर्जी और उनके दल का चीन का कोई मोटिव्स है, इस संबंध से कोई जिक्र नहीं करना चाहते। This is a sory thing, Sir; we still do not wish to. बात यह है कि एक तबका कुछ ऐसा है कि जो कभी भी इस भूमि को अपनी मातृभूमि नहीं मानता रहा। ...(**व्यवधान**)... और जिसकी दृष्टि हमेशा Moscow और Beijing की ओर रही है। ...(**व्यवधान**)... यह जो स्पीच हाऊस में दी गई थी और इस स्पीच को देने वाले थे, स्वर्गीय श्री सेठ गोविन्द दास जी। जो जबलपुर से कई वर्षों तक हर बार चुनकर आए और उन्होंने संसद में आप ही के दल की सेवा की और कई दशकों तक सेवा की। मैं अगर याद दिलाता हूं तो केवल इसलिए याद दिलाता हूं कि जो पचास साल से सिलसिला चल रहा है,उसको आप दबी जुबान से नहीं सुधार सकते हैं। एक सीधा सवाल केवल इतना ही था और आज भी वही है। And, Sir, permit me to complete what I have to say by just reading out, but I again submit to the House — now, I submit again —reiterate, and unambiguously repeat, but clearly, that this House is placing on record its high appreciation of the valiant struggle by men and officers of our Armed Forces who while defending our borders laid down their lives, and pays its respectful homage to the martyrs who have done so. And, with hope and faith, this House reaffirms its resolve of the Indian people that all aggression will be cleared from the Indian soil, however long and however hard this struggle may be. That Arunachal Pradesh is an integral part of India, that it is, India's sacred soil, and like any other part of India's soil, this is an inalienable part of

India and shall remain so. मैं आपसे निवेदन करना चाहता हूं, मेरा रूलिंग पार्टी से निवेदन है कि आप अपनी फॉरेन पॉलिसी को कम्युनिस्ट पार्टी की गिरवी मत रखिए ...(व्यवधान)...इसको गिरवी मत रखिए ...(व्यवधान)... इसको गिरवी मत रखिएगा ...(व्यवधान)...यदि इस तरीके से आप हमारी फारेन पालिसी को गिरवी रखेंगे तो देश हित कभी नहीं होगा ...(व्यवधान)...। थैंक यू ...(व्यवधान)...

श्री जनेश्वर मिश्र (उत्तर प्रदेश): आप देखिए सर ...(व्यवधान)...

श्री सभापति: एक मिनट, एक मिनट, मैं सभी को अलाऊ करूंगा ...(व्यवधान)...ठहिरए, ठहरिए ...(व्यवधान)... गवर्नमेंट इसका जवाब देगी ...(व्यवधान)...

श्री एस॰ एस॰ अहलुवालिया (झारखंड): जवाब क्या देना सर ...(व्यवधान)...

श्री सभापति: आप ठहरिए तो सही ...(व्यवधान)...

कार्मिक, लोक शिकायत और पेंशन मंत्रालय में राज्य मंत्री तथा संसदीय कार्य मंत्रालय में राज्य मंत्री (श्री सुरेश पचौरी): आदरणीय श्री सभापति महोदय ,...(व्यवधान)...

श्री एस. एस अहलुवालिया: यह प्रस्ताव है. ...(व्यवधान)...

श्री सभापति: आप ठहरिए ...(व्यवधान)...

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज: सभापति जी ...(व्यवधान)...

श्री सुरेश पचौरी: यह कोई तरीका नहीं है ...(व्यवधान)... हमारी बात भी सुननी चाहिए ...(व्यवधान)...

श्री सभापति: आप जवाब देना चाहें ...(व्यवधान)... ये बोल रहे हैं ...(व्यवधान)... आप पहले बोल लें ...(व्यवधान)...

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज: सभापति जी ,...(व्यवधान)...

श्री सभापति: पहले ये बोल लें ...(व्यवधान)... बोलिए ...(व्यवधान)... आप बैठिए ...(व्यवधान)...

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज: सभापति जी, मेरा ...(व्यवधान)...

श्री सभापति: इन्हें बोलने दीजिए ...(व्यवधान)...

श्री सीताराम येचुरी: सभापति जी ,...(व्यवधान)...

श्री सभापति: बात को सुन लिया ...(व्यवधान)...

श्री सीताराम येचुरी: सभापति जी, इतना ...(व्यवधान)... सुनो तो सही ...(व्यवधान)... Sir, this is not allowed ...*(Interruptions)*... You ask them to sit down. I am going to reply to all those charges ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज: सभापति जी, बी॰ ए॰ सी॰ में तय हुआ था ...(व्यवधान)... विदेश मंत्री जवाब दें ...(व्यवधान)... ये मंत्री क्यों खड़े हुए हैं ...(व्यवधान)... बी॰ ए॰ सी॰ में तय हुआ था ...(व्यवधान)... विदेश मंत्री होंगे तब जवाब देंगे ...(व्यवधान)... कल हम लोगों ने कहा था ...(व्यवधान)... विदेश मंत्री नहीं हैं ...(व्यवधान)... विदेश मंत्री को जवाब देना है ...(व्यवधान)... राज्य मंत्री जवाब नहीं देंगे सर ...(व्यवधान)...

श्री सुरेश पचौरी: सभापति जी, विदेश राज्य मंत्री यहां मौजूद हैं ...(व्यवधान)... आपकी तरफ से विदेश राज्य मंत्री भी बोल सकते हैं ...(व्यवधान)...

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज: यह तय हुआ था ...(व्यवधान)...

श्री सुरेश पचौरी: क्या तय हुआ था, क्या तय नहीं हुआ था ...(व्यवधान)... इस बात में मत पड़िए ...(व्यवधान)...

श्री सभापति: एक मिनट ...(व्यवधान)... एक मिनट ...(व्यवधान)...

SHRI PRAVEEN RASHTRAPAL: Sir, I have also given a notice that I may be allowed.

श्री सभापति: एक मिनट ...(व्यवधान)... एक मिनट ...(व्यवधान)... माननीय सदस्य परसों इनकी तरफ से इस पर चर्चा करने का नोटिस आया था। उस समय ये चर्चा करना चाहते थे। सरकार की तरफ से यह कहा गया था कि जब इसका उत्तर देने के लिए मंत्री महोदय सदन में होंगे तो इस पर चर्चा होगी। आज इन्होंने चर्चा उठाई है। यह शॉर्ट ड्यूरेशन डिसकशन में नहीं है, जीरो ऑवर की लिस्ट में है।

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज: जी। इन्होंने कहा था।

श्री सभापति: मैं बताऊंगा सुन लीजिए। जीरो ऑवर की लिस्ट में है। आपने अभी प्रस्ताव रखा है ...(व्यवधान)... बात तो सुन लीजिए ...(व्यवधान)... जीरो ऑवर की लिस्ट में है। ये बोल लें। इसके बाद येचुरी जी बोलें। उन्हें सुन लीजिए। सुनने के बाद गवर्नमेंट जो भी कहेगी, वह करेंगे।

श्री जनेश्वर मिश्र: हम भी बोलेंगे....(व्यवधान)...

श्री सभापति: आप बोलिएगा ...(व्यवधान)... मैं सभी को अलाऊ करूंगा ...(व्यवधान)... आप बोल लेना, मैं सभी को अलाऊ कर दूंगा ...(व्यवधान)... यह इम्पोर्टेन्ट विषय है। इस पर कोई बोलना चाहे तो मुझे कोई आपत्ति नहीं है ...(व्यवधान)...

श्री सीताराम येचुरी: सभापति महोदय, मेरी गुजारिश यही है कि जिस तरीके से हमने उन्हें सुना, उस तरीके से वे सुनें, सब्र करें।

श्री सभापति: हां, सब्र करें।

श्री सीताराम येचुरी: सब्र करके सवाल सुनिएगा। सर, सबसे पहले प्वाइंट तो यह है कि जहां तक अरुणाचल प्रदेश का सवाल है, as far as our position on Arunachal Pradesh is concerned, it pains me, sometimes, that somebody who is so senior, maybe, he has been in Parliament before I was born or not, I don't know; but, somebody who can stoop down to these levels of making such charges is, really, very appalling and very painful. As far as the position of India's territorial integrity is concerned, let me assure them and the House and irrespective of the charges that they have made, we stand by the fact that Arunachal Pradesh is an integral part of India and will always remain so. And, please don't spread such canards against us. As far as we are concerned, we have been stating, Sir, and we have said that very clearly all along that this is an issue of dispute between India and China. China is making claims which we do not accept. But if China is making claims, we have said and we continue to maintain since 1962, 'the way out and forward on this issue is through negotiations and discussion.' And, this is the position we have taken in 1962. ...*(Interruptions)*... Please listen. ...*(Interruptions)*... This is the thing ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज: दोनों बातें एक ही साथ कैसे हो सकती हैं ...(व्यवधान) Where is the question of negotiations? ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Sir, in this House, sitting here, our leader, then, Mr. Hiren Mukherjee, had in the proceedings made it very clear that all which we are asking is, this is an issue that cannot be settled through a fight, through a war. ...*(Interruptions)*... This is an issue that can be settled only through negotiations and discussions. ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज: क्या कहेंगे इनको ...(व्यवधान)...

---

*Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Sir, I am sorry, what they are displaying is an absolute *intolerance. ...*(Interruptions)*... This is *intolerance. You are not prepared to listen to our point of view. ...*(Interruptions)*...No; I am sorry to say this; this is a democracy. We are not going to be bulldozed by *intolerance. ...*(Interruptions)*...Sir, we are not going to be bulldozed by such *intolerance. ...*(Interruptions)*... This cannot be accepted. ...*(Interruptions)*... If they want to filibuster this debate, ...*(Interruptions)*... if they want to filibuster this debate, ...*(Interruptions)*...they are not prepared to accept the exposure of their*. You are not prepared to accept the exposure of your*. ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज: ये कह रहे हैं कि disputed territory है और negotiations की जाएंगी ... (व्यवधान)

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Sir, I am pleading to you. ...*(Interruptions)*... Sir, this is not to be allowed. ...*(Interruptions)*... Sir, let me speak. ...*(Interruptions)*... यही है आपका * रुझान, आप सुनना नहीं चाहते हो ... (व्यवधान) आप सुनना नहीं चाहते हो ... (व्यवधान)

SHRI PRASANTA CHATTERJEE (West Bengal): Sir, we should be allowed to complete it. ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री सभापति: आप लोग इनको सुनिए तो सही ... (व्यवधान)

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज: क्या सुनें? ये कह रहे हैं कि disputed territory है ... (व्यवधान)

श्री सभापति: माननीय सदस्यगण, एक मिनट, मेरी बात सुनिए ... (व्यवधान)

श्री सुरेश पचौरी: इनसे यह पूछ लीजिए कि Chamber में क्या discuss हुआ?

श्री सभापति: आप लोग बैठ जाइए। मैं पहले भी निवेदन कर चुका हूं कि सदन में परसों चर्चा हुई थी, कल चर्चा हुई और आज मेरे ऑफिस में चर्चा हुई। उस समय यह प्रश्न आया और Zero Hour के अंदर इसे उठाने की अनुमति दी गई, इसकी अनुमति Short Duration Discussion के अंतर्गत नहीं दी गई है। मेंबर्स का आग्रह था कि आज इस विषय पर जरूर चर्चा होनी चाहिए। मैं समझता हूं कि चर्चा होने में कोई बाधा क्यों उपस्थित हो? आपने चर्चा उठा ली, अब दूसरे भी बोलें ... (व्यवधान)

SHRI C. RAMACHANDRAIAH (Andhra Pradesh): He should be allowed to complete his speech. ...*(Interruptions)*...

*Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

श्री विक्रम वर्मा (मध्य प्रदेश): इन्होंने "disputed territory" शब्द का प्रयोग किया है ... (व्यवधान)...

श्री सभापति: आप बैठ जाइए, मैं खड़ा हूं ... (व्यवधान) इसमें दिक्कत क्या हो रही है? उनको बोलने दीजिए ... (व्यवधान)...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Sir, I can only beseech, I require your help. If this is the sort of a behaviour that is going to be seen in the House, which borders on * intolerance, this cannot be allowed in a democracy. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Therefore, Sir ... *(Interruptions)*...

DR. MURLI MANOHAR JOSHI (Uttar Pradesh): It is not like that... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI SANTOSH BAGRODIA (Rajasthan): Your behaviour has been like that... *(Interruptions)*...

DR. MURLI MANOHAR JOSHI: What you are saying is not right. It is not like that ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री सभापति: इन्हें बोलने दीजिए न कि इश्यू क्या है ... (व्यवधान)... आप इनको बोलने दीजिए ... (व्यवधान)...

श्री एस॰ एस॰ अहलुवालिया: पर हमारे आचरण पर भी टिप्पणी होगी ... (व्यवधान) ...

श्री सभापति: टिप्पणी क्या होगी, आप इन्हें बोलने दीजिए ... (व्यवधान) ... आप बोलेंगे, तो हाऊस के अन्दर चर्चा तो होगी ...(व्यवधान)... यह गलत बात है ...(व्यवधान) ...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Sir, I maintain even now ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री सभापति: देखिए, आपने मुझसे वादा किया था कि यह बोलेंगे। आपका वह वादा पूरा हो गया।

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज: बोलेंगे, पर वह बोलेंगे, जो भारत की एकता और अखंडता के लिए होगा ... (व्यवधान)...

श्री सभापति: उनको बोलने दीजिए न ... (व्यवधान)... अभी ये क्या बोल रहे हैं, इसका पता ही नहीं लग रहा है ... (व्यवधान)... उनको बोलने दीजिए ... (व्यवधान)... उन्हें क्या बोलना है, बोलने दीजिए ... (व्यवधान)...

---

*Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज: वे यह बोलेंगे कि चीन से डिस्कशन में लिया जाएगा, क्या सदन में यह बोलने दिया जाएगा ... (व्यवधान)... क्या यह बोलेंगे कि यह विवादित भूमि है ... (व्यवधान)...

श्री सभापति: वे क्या बोल रहे हैं, बोलने दीजिए ... (व्यवधान)...

श्री एस॰ एस॰ अहलुवालिया: भारत की एकता और अखंडता को अक्षुण्ण रखेंगे ...(व्यवधान)...

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज: वे यह बोलेंगे कि चीन से डिस्कशन ... (व्यवधान)... हमने इसे उठाया है ... (व्यवधान)... इस सीट पर बैठने से पहले हम सबने संविधान की शपथ खाई है कि भारत की एकता और अखंडता अक्षुण्ण रखेंगे ... (व्यवधान)...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Sir, may I ...*(Interruptions)*... सर, यह नहीं चल सकता, आप बोलने देंगे ... (व्यवधान)...

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज: हम यह बोलने नहीं देंगे ... (व्यवधान)...

श्री सीताराम येचुरी: मुझे बोलने दीजिए ... (व्यवधान)...

श्री एस॰ एस॰ अहलुवालिया: अक्षुण्ण रखेंगे ... (व्यवधान)...

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज: सभापति जी, यहां खड़े होकर इस सीट पर बैठने से पहले हम सबने संविधान की शपथ खाई है कि हम भारत की एकता और अखंडता अक्षुण्ण रखेंगे ... (व्यवधान)...

श्री सभापति: कसम खाई है, लेकिन ... (व्यवधान)...

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज: वे कह रहे हैं कि यह विवादित भूमि है ... (व्यवधान)...

श्री सभापति: इन्होंने जो पहले बोला है, आपने वह सुना होगा। उन्होंने स्पष्ट रूप से कहा है कि अरुणाचल प्रदेश हमारा है, भारत का हिस्सा है। उसके अलावा वे क्या कहना चाहते थे ...(व्यवधान)...

प्रो॰ राम देव भंडारी (बिहार): सर, इन्हें बोलने दिया जाए ... (व्यवधान)...

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज: जो आरोप लगाया गया, वह आरोप पहले वाक्य में ... (व्यवधान).. वे कह रहे हैं कि disputed territory है ... (व्यवधान)...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Sir, this is not to be allowed ...*(Interruptions)*... Sir, I am again saying it very clearly ...*(Interruptions)*... that

they are spreading untruths about our party's position. I have stated here on record, and I repeat what I have stated on record, and I wish to state on the charges that were hurled against us, that we have continuously maintained that this dispute can only be resolved through discussions and dialogue and not through war. Their Government continued this discussion ...*(Interruptions)*...They continued this discussion. Shri Jaswant Singh is the Leader of the Opposition. He continued this discussion ...*(Interruptions)*...and that is what I want to say. I want to place it on record that he is quoting of 1962 proceedings. The Communist Party of india (Marxist) was born in 1964. So, all the charges that he is making against us from the proceedings of 1962 are completely baseless and invalid. What we are now saying very clearly is that they are baseless and invalid ...*(Interruptions)*...Sir, the position that we have taken is exactly the position that the Government of India is now following and that is why we say that the CPI(M) has been vindicated; they have been following that. ...*(Interruptions)*...It is precisely that position and I want to state it very clearly that we cannot and we should not reduce the parliamentary proceedings and democracy in our country to a mockery. ...*(Interruptions)*... You cannot go on adopting resolutions saying that such and such State is a part of India. Integrity of India is defined by the Indian Constitution....*(Interruptions)*...So, you cannot pass resolutions for every State saying it is a part of India. Comparisons were being made to PoK.....*(Interruptions)*..Somebody said it was because PoK is under the occupation of another country, it is not a part of India today and that is why the Indian Parliament's Resolution. But that is not the case with Arunachal Pradesh, and when it is not the case with Arunachal Pradesh, there is no need for any Resolution to be there. सर, मैं यहां पर रेकार्ड पर रखना चाहूंगा ...(व्यवधान)... सर, मैं यह कहूंगा कि हमें* से देशभक्ति का सर्टिफिकेट नहीं चाहिए ....(व्यवधान)... *से देशभक्ति का सर्टिफिकेट नहीं चाहिए....(व्यवधान)... आप मेरी यह बात सुन लीजिए ...(व्यवधान)...

श्री सभापति : आप बैठिए ...(व्यवधान)... माननीय सदस्य, बैठिए, सरकारी पक्ष को सुनिए ...(व्यवधान)...

श्री सुरेश पचौरी : सभापति महोदय, 13 नवंबर, 2006 को चाइनीज एम्बैसडर के वक्तव्य को एक चैनल में दिखाया था। ....(व्यवधान)... दूसरे दिन 14 नवंबर, 2006 को विदेश मंत्री

*Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

श्री प्रणब मुखर्जी ने स्पष्ट किया था कि the whole of Arunachal is an integral part of India. ...(व्यवधान)... भारत सरकार के निर्देश पर चाइनीज एम्बैसडर के मंतव्य पर चीन में भारतीय एम्बैसडर श्रीमती निरुपमा राव ने दुख व्यक्त किया था।....(व्यवधान)... तत्कालीन प्रधान मंत्री श्री वाजपेयी की चीन यात्रा 22 से 27 जून, 2003 के समय भी इसी प्रकार के वक्तव्य से ऐसी स्थिति उत्पन्न हुई थी। ...(व्यवधान)... तत्कालीन विदेश मंत्री श्री यशवंत सिन्हा के वक्तव्य से मामला समाप्त हो गया था।..(व्यवधान)... तब श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज, संसदीय कार्य मंत्री थीं जो उस समय चर्चा के लिए तैयार नहीं थीं ...(व्यवधान)... अत: विदेश मंत्री श्री प्रणव मुखर्जी के अरुणाचल प्रदेश के संबंध में वक्तव्य के बाद इस पर चर्चा की कोई आवश्यकता नहीं है।...(व्यवधान)... सुषमा जी उस समय संसदीय कार्य मंत्री थीं और चर्चा के लिए तैयार नहीं थीं।...(व्यवधान)... यदि और कोई बिंदु हैं तो हमारे विदेश राज्य मंत्री बैठे हैं, वे स्पष्टीकरण दे सकते हैं।...(व्यवधान)...

श्री सभापति : सदन की कार्यवाही अपराह्न 2 बजे तक के लिए स्थगित की जाती है।

The House then adjourned at thirty-three minutes past twelve of the clock.

The House re-assembled after lunch at one minute past two of the clock.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN in the Chair.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Special Mentions.

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY : Mr. Deputy Chairman, Sir, Mr. Yechury has to continue. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY : Mr. Deputy Chairman, Sir. ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री अमर सिंह (उत्तर प्रदेश) : सर, श्री सीताराम येचुरी जी को बोलने का अवसर नहीं मिला है ...(व्यवधान)...

श्री उपसभापति: आप बैठिए ...(व्यवधान)... सीताराम जी, आप बैठिए ...(व्यवधान)...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY : Sir, I want to complete my speech. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I will give you an opportunity. ...*(interruptions)*...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY : When, Sir? ...*(Interruptions)*... Sir, you announce a particular time, I will sit down.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : How can I announce the time? ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY : Please permit me to speak. We heard them with all respect. Let me complete what I have to say. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI PRASANTA CHATTERJEE: Sir, it is our right to reply ...(*Interruptions*)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Yechury, I tell you ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: Sir, are you extending the Zero Hour?

श्री उपसभापतिः अहलुवालिया जी, आप बैठिए ...(व्यवधान)... आप बैठिए प्लीज़ ...(व्यवधान)... नहीं, नहीं ...(व्यवधान)...

SHRI SANTOSH BAGRODIA: There is no time limit for Zero Hour. ...(*Interruptions*)...

श्री उपसभापतिः चेयर को कुछ कहने तो दीजिए ...(व्यवधान)...

श्री संतोष बागड़ोदियाः उस समय बोलना ...(व्यवधान)... अपनी बात बोलने के समय ...(व्यवधान)...

श्री उपसभापतिः बागड़ोदिया जी, आप बैठिए ...(व्यवधान)... सीताराम जी, आप भी बैठिए। देखिए, जीरो ऑवर के बाद डिस्कशन खत्म हुआ, उसके बाद हाऊस एड्जर्न हुआ। हाउस के एड्जर्न होने के बाद usually on Friday, the house meets at 2.30 p.m. because for the last two days, we have not taken up Special Mentions, the Chair adjourned the House till 2 0' clock so that in this half-an-hour, we could take up Special Mentions. (*Interruptions*) One minute. As far as the discussion on the subject raised in the Zero Hour is concerned, the convention is that the House adjoirns, the Zero Hour ends. (*Interruptions*) It is not a discussion. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: No, Sir. The adjournment of the House during the Zero Hour was a forced adjournment. (*Interruptions*)

Mr. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, no. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI SITARMAN YECHURY: Yes, Sir. They walked into the Well of the House. Because you couldn't manage, so, you adjourned the House. Had it been under the normal course. I would have ...(*Interruptions*)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The Chairman said that ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI SITARMAN YECHURY: No, Sir. Had the House been adjourned under the normal course, I would have accepted your ruling. (*Interruptions*)

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I don't know. ...(*Interruptions*)... Mr. Yechury, I am bound by the ruling of the Chairman. The Chairman has on record said that this was concluded. What can I do? I cannot reopen. (*Interruptions*) I agree, I agree, but the Chairman has said on record that the discussion was concluded. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Sir, they have called me by all sorts of names. (*Interruptions*) This is my right to reply. (*Interruptions*)

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You can give that in writing. That can be..(*Interruptions*)

SHRI SITARMAN YECHURY: Under any democracy, whenever any charges are made, the right to reply is a fundamental right. You cannot deny me my fundamental right in this House. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: Sir, are you extending the discussion?

(*Interruptions*)

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Sir, they have made charges, they have made allegations. They have made baseless charges. I do not need these sorts of certificates of patriotism or non-patriotism from the ideologues of ...(*Interruptions*)... of Mahatma Gandhi, which led to killing of thousands of people.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: What I request is that you kindly give it in writing. You have the right ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: I do not accept that sort of a thing. Sir, it is my right to reply, I have the right to reply to those charges levelled against me. Please allow me to exercise my right (*Interruptions*)

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I cannot reopen it, Mr. Yechury. I cannot do this.

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Mr. Deputy Chairman, Sir, I fully respect Your ...(*Interruptions*)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I agree. Mr. Yechury, you mentioned it to the Chairman also. I was present here. You mentioned it to the Chairman and he said that the discussion was concluded.

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Till 2.30 p.m., you have time for the Private Members' Bill. That is sacrosanct. I do not want to disturb that. But, in the interevening time, just give me ten minutes to reply.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, no. The hon. Chairman has said that the matter is concluded.

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: You please let me speak for five minutes and then you can do that ...(*Interruptions*)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: This discussion cannot be reopened, please. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Then, you give a ruling that you will have a full discussion.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You give it in writing. We will definitely discuss it. ...(*Interruptions*)... That is your right. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Sir, since all that he has said is on record, let what I am saying go on record. I am saying this is a mockery of Indian democracy. If you want to go on saying every State is a part of India and you want a Resolution ...(*Interruptions*)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, I can't reopen it. ...(*Interruptions*)...

No, Mr. Yechury, I cannot reopen it. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: On Pok, you passed a Resolution ...(*Interruptions*)... That is different from what it is here. ...(*Interruptions*)... And, there sort of charges are being levelled.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You had been given the opportunity. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: I was denied the opportunity, not from the Chair; I was denied by them. I am helpless. I am pleading for your help. I am pleading for the Chair's help to allow me to complete.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I agree with your view. But, I cannot reopen it because the hon. Chairman has concluded it. I cannot reopen it. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: You cannot reopen something that is closed. I agree. But, this debate is not closed. It is going on. He is sitting there ...(*Interruptions*)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The House is adjourned till 2.30. p.m.

The House then adjourned at seven minutes past two of the clock.

The House re-assembled at thirty minutes past two of the clock.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN in the Chair,

PRIVATE MEMBERS' BILLS

The Illegal Immigrants (Identification and Deportation) Bill, 2006

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Bills for Introduction. Shrimati Hema Malini, not here. Shri Manohar Joshi.

SHRI MANOHAR JOSHI (Maharashtra): Sir, I move for leave to introduce a Bill to set up a National Commission to identify and deport illegal immigrants in the country and for matters connected therewith and incidental thereto.

The question was put and the motion was adopted.

SHRI MANOHAR JOSHI: Sir, I introduce the Bill.

The Constitution (Amendment) Bill, 2006. (Amendment of Articles 103 and Insertion of New Article 324A)

SHRI MANOHAR JOSHI (Maharashtra): Sir, I move for leave to introduce a Bill further to amend the Constitution of India.

The question was put and the motion was adopted.

SHRI MANOHAR JOSHI: Sir, I introduce the Bill.

The Constitution (Amendment) Bill, 2006. (Omission of Article 370)

SHRI MANOHAR JOSHI (Maharashtra): Sir, I move for leave to introduce a Bill further to amend the Constitution of India.

The question was proposed.